Memorandum

To: Honorable Doug Burgum, Governor
   Honorable Kelly Schmidt, State Treasurer
   Honorable Joshua Gallion, State Auditor
   Honorable Doug Goehring, Commissioner of Agriculture
   Honorable Ryan Rauschenberger, Tax Commissioner

From: Linda Leadbetter, State Supervisor of Assessments

Date: September 26, 2018

Subject: Meeting of the State Board of Equalization

The State Board of Equalization will meet in the Peace Garden Room of the North Dakota State Capitol, Thursday, October 4, 2018, at 10:30 a.m.

The following items are on the agenda:

1. Approval of the minutes of the September 24, 2018, meeting

2. File No. 714. Application submitted by CoSchedule, LLC, for a five-year, 100 percent income tax exemption for a business project in Fargo, North Dakota. ED&F finds the project qualifies as a primary sector business.

3. Other business

cc: John F. Schneider, Commerce Department
    Sandy McMerty, Deputy Tax Commissioner
The State Board of Equalization met in the Peace Garden Room of the North Dakota State Capitol, Monday, September 24, 2018.

The following member was absent:
Doug Goehring, Commissioner of Agriculture

The following members were present:
Governor Doug Burgum, Chairperson
Kelly Schmidt, State Treasurer
Josh Gallion, State Auditor
Ryan Rauschenberger, Commissioner of Tax and Secretary of the State Board of Equalization

It was moved by Auditor Gallion and seconded by Treasurer Schmidt to approve the minutes of the August 14 meeting. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.

Commissioner Rauschenberger went through procedural items. He noted all items have been investigated, working with cities, counties and appellants to reach today’s recommendations. If there is no recommendation, no motion or vote is needed by the board. Commissioner Rauschenberger mentioned we’re the last step in the appeal process for property valuations, but the taxpayer always has the option of the abatement process as well. The recommendations from staff are for board consideration, however this is not a hearing, so floor testimony is upon approval of the chair only.

The meeting was turned over to Linda Leadbetter, State Supervisor of Assessments to begin review of appeals.

Ms. Leadbetter reviewed the analysis for Barnes County commercial property. A recommendation to direct Barnes County to reduce commercial assessments by 6% was presented. Motion by Treasurer Schmidt. Second by Commissioner Rauschenberger. Governor Burgum asked for explanation on the valuation. Ms. Leadbetter explained that there were some errors in the calculation and that she had worked with the tax director to review. New values were resubmitted and recalculated resulting in the recommendation of a reduction of 6%. Governor Burgum asked if we would change the “issue” language in at the beginning of the statements so they would not use the word “need.” Staff agreed to make the adjustment throughout the recommendations to reflect less confusing language. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.

Kristine Hillaert, Property Tax Specialist, presented the recommendation for the Barnes County – Schroeder residential appeal. It was recommended that no action be taken as the appellant did not follow the appeal process. Governor Burgum asked which part of the processes was missed. Ms. Leadbetter explained the citizen had not appealed to the township or county, prior to the state board, as is the process required by law, and noted the citizen could still follow the abatement processes if desired. No action needed.

Dustin Bakken, Property Tax Specialist, presented information for the Burke County - Basin Transload facility. A review of the assessment resulted in a recommendation of reducing the structure values on the parcels by 62% to account for the economic obsolescence factor. Motion by Commissioner Rauschenberger. Second by Auditor Gallion. Governor Burgum asked if we are applying a consistent methodology across review of industrial
properties. Mr. Bakken shared that in real property verses personal property issues, the answer is yes; however, this property has the obsolescence issue which would be specific to this property. Governor Burgum asked if other properties might come back and want their assets looked at in this manner. Commissioner Rauschenberger reminded that this property and others would have the abatement process available if they had concerns. It was noted that the facility is located in Columbus, Burke County, near the Canadian border, and nowhere in the Bakken oil footprint. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.

Ms. Leadbetter reviewed the analysis on Cavalier County residential property. The review resulted in a recommendation of decreasing all residential assessments by 5%. Motion by Commissioner Rauschenberger. Second by Auditor Gallion. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.

Mr. Bakken presented information on the Cavalier County – Fremont Township Valentine appeal regarding agricultural land assessments. It was recommended there be no change to the assessments, but that the county be asked to work directly with the landowner on future assessments and report back to this board to ensure data is accurate. Motion by Commissioner Rauschenberger. Second by Auditor Gallion. Governor Burgum questioned if the county was using appropriate soil valuations. Mr. Bakken indicated that there were some small errors in some of the data, but they resulted in no significant errors in the soil valuations themselves. Treasurer Schmidt asked if this is similar to an incident with Mr. Valentine she remembered from last year. It was shared this was a separate issue. Mr. Bakken shared that the county has been asked to work in concert with the townships to ensure appropriate valuations. Treasurer Schmidt asked to what end result. Mr. Bakken said we intend to report back on their progress based on the issues that have occurred. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.

Ms. Leadbetter reviewed the Foster County commercial property tolerance. Foster County was found to be below the tolerance level and a recommendation was made to increase all commercial properties by 4%. Motion by Treasurer Schmidt. Second by Commissioner Rauschenberger. Auditor Gallion noted that this recommendation is outside, or above, the 90% tolerance level of the board and cannot support. Ms. Leadbetter related that this board had directed that counties below 90% in tolerance would be brought to 93%. Governor Burgum asked about what the board’s decisions on levels was. Ms. Leadbetter explained that a range from 90-100% had been set based on the board’s prior conversation. Commissioner Rauschenberger shared that last year Kevin Ternes was brought in to educate about the board about tolerance levels, and encouraged the board to create a range for counties to shoot for to attempt to move them towards 100%. The goal of which is to ensure that all classes have a fair tax burden and that one class isn’t bearing more burden than it should. Governor Burgum questioned, based on the data we have, can we narrow the band of tolerance from a 10% range, to 7% if we are taking them to 93% anyway. Ms. Leadbetter noted that international standards are followed regarding assessment tolerances, and that a 10% range in tolerance is very acceptable. She also explained that the 93% was established to provide a goal to gain greater consistency and to move jurisdictions closer. Upon voice vote, Commissioner Rauschenberger, Treasurer Schmidt, Governor Burgum – Aye; Auditor Gallion – Nay. Motion carried.

Information on the Grant County commercial property tolerance was reviewed. Ms. Leadbetter recommended that Grant County increase commercial assessments by 11% and review notice requirements. Motion by Commissioner Rauschenberger. Second by Treasurer Schmidt. Governor Burgum asked about methodology, which Ms. Leadbetter reviewed, noting that percentages can seem large on smaller sale properties. She reviewed the factors considered and the valuations used. Governor Burgum asked if the outliers are included in the usable sales, and Ms. Leadbetter explained that as arm’s-length transactions, they are included, but explained the median ratio. Governor Burgum questioned if our process is good enough for counties which have small sample sizes. Ms. Leadbetter noted there are other approaches that can be used for small sample counties,
such as the cost approach, income approach, etc.; so there is methodology in these instances. Governor Burgum asked if data is tracked by county in terms of usable sales, and are there trend lines. She noted that the sales study tracks sales on an annual basis, and they can use three prior years for numbers, and the current assessment; therefore, we’d have history of the usable sales. It was noted that a new tax director in this county did require some adjustments on how calculations were made. Upon voice vote, Commissioner Rauschenberger, Treasurer Schmidt, Governor Burgum – Aye; Auditor Gallion – Nay. Motion carried.

Ms. Leadbetter reviewed information on Grant County residential properties, many of which are lakeshore property. A recommendation of a 20% increase in assessments on lakeshore was made. Motion by Commissioner Rauschenberger. Second by Treasurer Schmidt. Treasurer Schmidt asked why “residential” lakeshore was included. Ms. Leadbetter noted that they didn’t see discrepancies in the commercial properties on the lakeshore, but did in the residential which resulted in the recommendation. Governor Burgum asked are we getting them to 89%, not 93%. Ms. Leadbetter shared that since this was lakeshore, when combined with non-lakeshore residential, which was at 95% (primary residence), it allowed them to stay in the tolerance levels at the county level. Governor Burgum noted that language in the recommendation needed to be updated slightly. Treasurer Schmidt asked if all counties break out lakeshore property. Ms. Leadbetter noted that if they can identify it as such and can do so in sales they should be identifying. Auditor Gallion asked about a person who is above 86%, and would that property be above 100% with this adjustment. Ms. Leadbetter noted that a taxpayer who is above would have the ability to file for abatement with the county. She explained that when equalizing across a property class, there is often a taxpayer who falls into a position of outlier, (above or below tolerance) which is why the abatement process is in place to give a taxpayer a process to seek fairness based on the broad class decision. Upon voice vote, Commissioner Rauschenberger, Treasurer Schmidt, Governor Burgum – Aye; Auditor Gallion – Nay. Motion carried.

Ms. Hillaert reviewed the appeal by Hettinger County on the Schatz residential property. It was shared that the concerns were based on the property in question being compared to a newer property, which was 26 years younger, with greater square footage. Recommendation of no change was presented. No action needed.

Ms. Leadbetter presented the LaMoure County agricultural information. A direction to LaMoure County to increase agricultural land assessments by 5% was made. Motion by Commissioner Rauschenberger. Second by Treasurer Schmidt. Auditor Gallion noted it could be increased by just 2% to 90%, which would be in tolerance. Treasurer Schmidt noted that this board works to move assessments incrementally, so moving to 90% means coming back later for a bigger ask in a following year and that is why the board has pushed for 93% as a goal point for counties below 90%. If a change in philosophy is the desire of the board, Treasurer Schmidt encouraged that to happen after the meeting. Commissioner Rauschenberger agreed with the current policy direction and encouraged open discussion if the board would like to revisit the recommendation of 93%. Governor Burgum noted that the board’s actions relate to an equalized assessment within a jurisdiction, and do not necessarily create a tax increase. Upon voice vote, Commissioner Rauschenberger, Treasurer Schmidt, Governor Burgum – Aye; Auditor Gallion – Nay. Motion carried.

Ms. Leadbetter continued with the LaMoure County commercial property review. She shared the process of investigation and gave a recommendation to increase all commercial assessments by 8%, and provide a report back to the board by December. Motion by Treasurer Schmidt. Second by Commissioner Rauschenberger. Ms. Leadbetter provided a greater explanation into the market value around the property assessments to better explain the adjustment after a recent review by Vanguard Assessments, which is why a report back to the board was asked for to ensure appropriate values coming into the 2019 tax cycle. Governor Burgum asked if the county had the appropriate information. It was noted that some changes in tax director staffing and visits with the county resulted in the outcome presented today. The goal is to help stabilize shifts in the taxation. Ms. Leadbetter shared
that continuing education with new tax directors is ongoing. Upon voice vote, Commissioner Rauschenberger, Treasurer Schmidt, Governor Burgum – Aye; Auditor Gallion – Nay. Motion carried.

Ms. Leadbetter shared information on the Pembina County commercial property tolerance. The team reviewed the information from a new tax director and found them to be below tolerance. A recommendation of an increase of 7% on all commercial properties was made. Motion by Treasurer Schmidt. Second by Commissioner Rauschenberger. Governor Burgum asked if there is any way to ask the county to move its aggregate to 93% or is this impacted by the data limit. Ms. Leadbetter explained that they will work with the assessors to look at grouping their assessments to create similarities in the information they are reviewing. She sees it as a goal in assessment education to continuously be working with assessors to keep information up to date to consider incremental changes in their data. Governor Burgum wanted to know as we work to get counties to 100%, could we ever direct them to get their aggregate value to 93%, rather than a fixed percentage increase. Ms. Leadbetter reflected that that’s what we hope they are doing on an annual basis relating to their sales and information they are gathering. A question regarding the timeline of this change was asked, Ms. Leadbetter shared that the change needs to be made so they can create the 2018 assessment for this taxable valuation. Treasurer Schmidt reflected that assessors sometimes cannot hit challenges in moving values in their own jurisdictions as commissions don’t always agree with the recommendations brought forward. Upon voice vote, Commissioner Rauschenberger, Treasurer Schmidt, Governor Burgum – Aye; Auditor Gallion – Nay. Motion carried.

Ms. Leadbetter reviewed the Richland County residential tolerance. Based on review of properties, a recommendation of an increase of 7% on all residential assessments was made. Motion by Commissioner Rauschenberger. Second by Treasurer Schmidt. Sandy Fossum, Richland County Tax Director, spoke in favor of the recommendation and shared she wished it could be more. Upon voice vote, Commissioner Rauschenberger, Treasurer Schmidt, Governor Burgum – Aye; Auditor Gallion – Nay. Motion carried.

Ms. Hillaert shared information on Sioux County commercial property. She reviewed that the last commercial sale in Sioux County was four years ago. She prepared appraisals on properties and shared the methodology use to come up with a recommendation of no change, but asked that Sioux County report back to the board in December with regards to creating property tax record cards and assessment information. Motion by Treasurer Schmidt. Second by Commissioner Rauschenberger. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.

Ms. Hillaert continued with a recommendation of an increase of 15% on all Sioux County residential property. In working with the Sioux County tax director, a process of review was conducted and the director is in support of this recommendation. A report back to the board is requested, along with the creation of property cards for all residential property. Treasurer Schmidt asked if it was a new assessor, and it was shared it was not. The Auditor and Tax Director is a shared position in Sioux County, with limited availability to do assessments. Sioux County, shared Ms. Leadbetter, has very limited parcels that are taxable. Governor Burgum asked if this was only on private deeded land, not trust land. It was shared that this is only for taxable property. Motion by Commissioner Rauschenberger. Second by Treasurer Schmidt. Governor Burgum asked where the 15% gets us to tolerance. Ms. Leadbetter shared that as there is limited data it was not possible to make this determination, however values are low and the 15% is a move in the appropriate direction as more information is gathered for future review. Upon voice vote, Commissioner Rauschenberger, Treasurer Schmidt, Governor Burgum – Aye; Auditor Gallion – Nay. Motion carried.

Governor Burgum asked Auditor Gallion if he would share his logic behind his no vote on the prior issue. Auditor Gallion shared he did not feel he had enough information to support an increase when there was not information on where tolerance actually fell, or how 15% was arrived at.
Kimberly Vietmeier, Property Tax Specialist, shared information on the Stark County - Dickinson 8th Avenue appeal by Carlos Royal. An analysis was conducted and a recommendation of no change was presented. No action needed. The Governor asked what approaches had been used in the determination. Ms. Vietmeier shared she used three varying methods, and feels that the county board approved the correct value. Governor Burgum asked if we were dealing with Stark County appeals in one motion. Commissioner Rauschenberger shared we’ll be taking them one at a time as each are different. Governor Burgum invited David Bauer, who represents the property management for Carlos Royal, to speak. Mr. Bauer shared that he believes inappropriate expense amounts have been used in making the determinations, and still has a remaining concern. City Assessor for Dickinson, Joe Hirschfeld, shared that they are using the Vanguard method for valuation, and that many other properties that are valued have not brought forward issues. He requested we not make adjustments as it will make other properties question their valuations if we’re adjusting these few. He shared Vanguard will be making a property review in 2019.

Governor Burgum asked to review all the Dickinson appeals prior to voting.

Ms. Vietmeier reviewed information on the Dickinson Century Apartments, owned by Carlos Royal, and recommended a decrease in parcel value of 35%.

Ms. Vietmeier continued with the Dickinson Park Place review. The method of analysis was shared with the group. Ms. Vietmeier explained that on all properties in Stark County she applied three approaches to value – cost, income, and sales. Based on the analysis, a recommendation of a 16% decrease was suggested for this property.

Governor Burgum asked if valuations approved by the city were changed by the county. Ms. Vietmeier shared that indeed you will see that change in most of the properties presented as explained in the first paragraph of the report. Ms. Vietmeier provided insight into her methodology as she looked at each property. Governor Burgum asked if there was availability of broad data from the city regarding vacancy and sales. Mr. Hirschfeld shared that the city is seeing lower vacancies, and that rents are going up in some properties.

The next property under review was the Dickinson Royal Manor, owned by Carlos Royal. A recommendation of an increase of 7% was presented.

With regards to the Dickinson Silvergate Townhomes, owned by Carlos Royal, a recommendation of a decrease by 23% was presented.

The next property reviewed was the Dickinson 23rd Avenue property, owned by Terrance Clement. A recommendation of a decrease of 11% was presented. The year built and amenities in the property weighed in the valuation, as this is a larger rental unit.

Another property owned by Terrance Clement, Jewel Blue, was recommended as a decrease of 10%. Governor Burgum asked about the city/county valuations and it was shared this property was similar to the other instances. He asked if the city and county were using different numbers or do we know what the difference is. Natalie Wandler, Stark County Tax Director, shared that the county went with Mr. Hirschfeld’s original recommendation. The group felt leaving them for this year was appropriate and asked for a reassessment next year. Governor asked if the city assessments go to the county first. Ms. Leadbetter shared that the separate governing bodies do function as their own entities and adopt the assessments at the respective meetings. Ms.
Leadbetter shared that cities and townships meet in April and then need to share information with the county for its June equalization meeting.

Information on the Abode property, owned by Terrance Clement, was shared. It was recommended that there be a reduction of 18%.

The final property Temili, owned by Terrance Clement was reviewed. It was recommended that the assessment be reduced by 25%.

Governor Burgum asked if the starting point for these properties was 11% below the prior year. Mr. Hirschfeld confirmed that was the case, and that the city was attempting to stay above the 90% tolerance. Governor Burgum asked if any of these recommendations move the county out of tolerance. Ms. Leadbetter shared that when they review individual appeals they do not take into account the impact on the overall tolerance at the county level.

Governor Burgum asked about the aggregate of these changes. Commissioner Rauschenberger shared we could calculate that fairly quickly, but reminded that we do not take that into account in reviewing the individual appeal. Mr. Hirschfeld shared as an estimate it would likely be about a 2% decrease overall in tolerance. Governor Burgum noted we have nine individual appeals on apartment buildings out of the 196 total apartments. Mr. Hirschfeld shared his concerns with some of these adjustments is that they could take these apartments below where values should be. He shared, based on his assessment, he was comfortable coming in a little high as it would help to manage the swings that can be created by a volatile market. Commissioner Rauschenberger shared that we need to look at assessments as of February 1, and work with the data received to make the best recommendation we can on that timeframe. He noted that Mr. Hirschfeld is right, that data can move a lot in a short time, but we must look to the deadline date of February 1. Governor Burgum reflected that our goal is not to be forecasters, but to look at it from a date in time.

Governor Burgum shared that if we move forward with the recommendations presented here, those values would be in place to begin the process next year as well. He questioned if we are high on the way down, how do we end up at 90% and possible 88%, if we are on the downslope. Ms. Leadbetter reflected this isn’t just apartments, it is all commercial properties, which then makes it more complex. Governor Burgum asked if we know what the percentage of properties in Dickinson is apartments. Mr. Hirschfeld shared that it is likely below 1/3 to 25% of all properties in the city.

Governor Burgum shared we have 9 appeals to vote on and that votes would be taken in the order reviewed.

- 8th Avenue – Motion by Treasurer Schmidt. Second by Auditor Gallion. Recommendation is no change. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.
- Century – Motion by Treasurer Schmidt. Second by Auditor Gallion. Recommendation decrease of 35%. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.
- Park Place – Motion by Treasurer Schmidt. Second by Auditor Gallion. Recommendation of a decrease of 16%. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.
- Royal Manor – Motion by Commissioner Rauschenberger. Second by Auditor Gallion. Recommendation increase of 7%. Governor Burgum asked about the methodology. It was shared we used multiple methods to determine this amount. Commissioner Rauschenberger noted that our valuations are simply an adjustment off of the original valuation. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.
- Slivergate Townhouse – Motion by Treasurer Schmidt. Second by Auditor Gallion. Recommendation of a decrease of 23%. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.
- 23rd Avenue – Motion by Treasurer Schmidt. Second by Auditor Gallion. Recommendation of a decrease of 11%. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.
- Jewel Blue – Motion by Treasurer Schmidt. Second by Auditor Gallion. Recommendation of a decrease of 10%. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.
- Abode – Motion by Treasurer Schmidt. Second by Auditor Gallion. Recommendation of an 18% reduction. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.
- Temili – Motion by Treasurer Schmidt, Second by Auditor Gallion. Recommendation of a 25% reduction. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.

Ms. Leadbetter shared the recommendation for Steele County commercial property. No action is recommended. No action is needed.

Mr. Bakken shared the Dakota Spirit Ethanol appeal from Stutsman County. He reviewed some of the appraisal information from the appellant. A site visit was conducted and the issue of real versus personal property valuation was considered. A review of individual assets was conducted and a recommendation of a reduction of 60% was presented. Governor Burgum questioned what was classified as personal. Mr. Bakken shared it was anything that would effectuate the process. The real property that was left was buildings, bins, and items related to those buildings. Motion by Treasurer Schmidt. Second by Auditor Gallion. Governor Burgum invited Jeff Zuger, CEO for Dakota Ag Energy, to the podium. Mr. Zuger thanked Mr. Bakken for his professionalism in his review. He had a recommendation that the state have trained assessors available to counties in the matter of industrial properties. He also recommended a clearer definition with regards to real and personal property. Treasurer Schmidt said the legislature needs to get on board with that. Governor Burgum asked if the Tax Department would consider this change moving forward. Commissioner Rauschenberger shared this is a continuing discussion, and we currently use a Supreme Court decision that created the guidelines we follow. He shared we’ve asked the tax assessors to look at a better definition of real versus personal property. Commissioner Rauschenberger shared he’ll be meeting with assessors again, and will encourage them to move this process forward. He related that it truly needs to be a team effort. Treasurer Schmidt feels that those who come into the state to do assessments, need to be trained similar to our assessors. This is legislation she feels could be a good beginning to make this process more consistent and hold outside agencies to the same standard. Governor asked for anyone from Stutsman County to speak. Tyler Perleberg, Tax Director from Stutsman County, asked for greater clarity for real versus personal property. He felt that having an industrial appraisal wasn’t really helpful in their process. The best guidelines he has seen were from the 1971 Supreme Court Decision, so he’d like to see greater clarity. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.

Mr. Bakken shared the Anderson property appeal in Traill County report. He noted there were changes made to the structures since the facility’s purchase and some improvements were made. He did an analysis of these changes and made a recommendation of a reduction of 32%. He noted the facility no longer meets the requirements for a BNSF loading facility. Motion by Treasurer Schmidt. Second by Auditor Gallion. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.

The Williston Ridgeview appeal was reviewed by Ms. Hillaert. She conducted a site visit and communicated with HUD in Williston to determine the fair market value on this property. It was recommended to reduce the assessment by 35%. Motion by Commissioner Rauschenberger. Second by Treasurer Schmidt. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.

The Williston Nokota property was presented with a recommendation to reduce the value by 22%. This property was also analyzed using information from HUD. Motion by Auditor Gallion. Second by Commissioner Rauschenberger. Governor Burgum asked if it is normal on a low-income property to value that property lower.
Ms. Leadbetter shared that if using an income method, limited rents will be taken into consideration. A slight error in wording in the recommendation was noted to be adjusted. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.

Governor asked for any other business. Commissioner Rauschenberger moved to approve all residential, commercial and agricultural values for all counties across the state, and to make the same changes that were made to agricultural land to: Game & Fish land, Board of University & School Lands, North Dakota National Guard land, Farmland or Ranchland Owned by Nonprofit Organizations for Conservation Purposes and Land Acquired for the Devils Lake Project. Second by Auditor Gallion. Governor Burgum asked if the reference to Devils Lake is the Devils Lake project, which Ms. Leadbetter confirmed to be true as created in law. Upon voice vote, all participating members voted “aye.” Motion carried.

Commissioner Rauschenberger thanked the board and the property tax team, and those in attendance for being part of this process. Treasurer Schmidt asked where we can go with the direction of requiring out of state assessors to have the same education as our in-state assessors. Commissioner Rauschenberger shared that anyone can put a valuation on the land, but it is ultimately up to the Tax Director. There is some question around if the state should do industrial assessments, but that creates conflict as the state also equalizes. Treasurer Schmidt shared she continues to hear that tax directors need clarity and wondered how we can create better process. She encouraged support of any efforts in this direction. Governor Burgum noted that Commissioner Rauschenberger and Treasurer Schmidt can bring up this topic when they meet with the tax directors later this fall. Commissioner Rauschenberger noted that the tax directors are now a part of the North Dakota Association of Counties board so they may be a key partner.

Governor Burgum thanked the staff members for their work, and those who traveled to participate today. Meeting adjourned 2:52 p.m.